



**SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
THURSDAY, JULY 6, 2006
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ**

PRESENT: Ed Wimmer, Chair
George Hartz, Vice-Chair
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

ABSENT: Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
Dezbah Hatathli, Commissioner

STAFF: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele
Ian Johnson
Joanna Munar

ALSO PRESENT: Cornel Bogdan
Maria Bogdan
Randy Martens
Karen LaFond
Bruce Brown
William Rudd Gruntler
Richard Nagy
Richard Funke

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Chair Wimmer at 5:33 p.m.

1. Introductions and Roll Call

A roll call confirmed the members present as stated above.

2. Minutes: June 8, 2006 and June 3, 2006 Tour Notes

COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED TO APPROVE THE JUNE 3, 2006 TOUR NOTES, WITH A SECOND BY COMMISSIONER WINSLOW. THE TOUR NOTES WERE APPROVED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE JUNE 8, 2006 MEETING, AS WRITTEN. COMMISSIONER WINSLOW SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

3. Public Hearing Item: 6707 E. Coronado Road Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Johnson, Intern gave a presentation and referred to photographs, site plan, and construction drawings. In conversations with the applicant, the roof over the carport addition will be modified to be a gable roof rather than a flat roof as originally planned. Board-and-batten siding is recommended for the side of the carport and for the end of the new gable roof.

Mr. Nagy, representing the owner, voiced concern over the recommendation for board-and-batten siding. He stated he had observed that less than half the homes in the neighborhood have board-and-batten, and this block house did not have any original board-and-batten siding. The applicant has used T-1 siding for the side of the enclosed garage that has vertical scoring every eight inches.

Discussion ensued on the appropriate siding material for homes in Village Grove. Commissioner Winslow recommended that tongue-and-groove siding be used instead of the board-and-batten. Commissioner Lockwood voiced agreement.

COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED TO ACCEPT THE MODIFICATIONS TO THE CERTIFICATION OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 6707 E. CORONADO ROAD WITH THE PROVISION THAT THE GABLE ROOF HAVE A CLOSED END WITH APPROPRIATE MATCHING SIDING AND THAT THE EAVE CONDITION APPROXIMATE THE CONDITION OF THE EXISTING GARAGE. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

4. Review/possible action: HRER Committee Recommendations on June 1, 2006 Applications

Ms. Abele distributed a handout that summarized the recommendations of the Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation (HRER) Committee. A total of 14 applications were received and four were considered incomplete and ineligible for review. Of the remaining ten applications, the Committee recommends that four projects be approved for matching funding of \$10,000 each. A letter of explanation will be sent to the four applicants who were not approved so that they can resubmit an application in the future if desired.

Ms. Abele informed the Commission that the Committee felt that five of the applications needed further consideration and/or additional information. The Committee is requesting that meetings be conducted with these five applicants to discuss improvements and revisions to their applications. Ms. Abele was hopeful that recommendations on the revised applications could be presented at the August HPC meeting.

In response to an inquiry by Vice-Chair Hartz, Ms. Abele stated that funding was available for all the approved applications but, if the budgeted monies are not expended for the rehab program, they could be lost.

Commissioner Winslow suggested that a portfolio of examples of approved applications be made available to applicants to provide guidance.

Ms. Abele stated that applicants who had attended the workshops submitted better applications, but that staff would modify the application to provide more clarity.

Chair Wimmer opened the meeting for public comments on the rehab program.

Ms. Karen LaFond, 7323 E. Cypress Lane, stated she was one of the applicants who was not approved and that she found the application confusing. She inquired as to whether, once an application had been denied, if a request could be made to meet with someone who can provide assistance in completing the application. Chair Wimmer stated that staff would be available for that purpose. Ms. LaFond also stated that a vendor list would be helpful in that it is difficult to find vendors who understand the preservation aspect of a modification and/or improvement. Chair Wimmer stated that it was part of the Commission's role and mission to provide this type of support and information.

COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED TO:

(1) ACCEPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HRER COMMITTEE TO ACCEPT THE FOUR PROJECTS, AS PRESENTED, FOR FULL MATCHING FUNDING OF \$10,000 EACH;

(2) DIRECT STAFF TO ASSIST, HOWEVER POSSIBLE, THOSE APPLICANTS WHO DID NOT MEET THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA;

(3) INSTRUCT STAFF TO NOTIFY THE CITY COUNCIL THAT THE COMMISSION HAS THE ABILITY TO EFFECTIVELY UTILIZE ALL THE FUNDING THAT HAS BEEN PROVIDED FOR THIS PURPOSE.

COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF FIVE (5) TO ZERO (0).

5. Report/ Possible Action: Historic Register Committee Recommendation on Charles Miller House

Commissioner and Committee Chair Howard stated that Committee members were in agreement that the house has historical significance because of its association with a prominent member of the community and is one of the few remaining wood-frame bungalow-style houses in Scottsdale. However, the Committee is concerned about the lack of integrity of the metal roof since metal roofs were not used on bungalow-style residences around 1915 when this house was built. The Committee recommends to the Commission that the house be considered for designation on the Scottsdale Historic Register, with the stipulation that the roof be replaced with roofing material, i.e., wood shingles, appropriate to the era and bungalow style.

In response to an inquiry by Chair Wimmer, Ms. Abele explained that, after an investigation of the Phoenix area, there was no evidence that metal roofs were used on bungalow homes in this era.

In response to inquiries by Commissioner Winslow, Ms. Abele explained that although metal roofs were used outside of urban areas, they were not an urban building material in the time period in which the Miller house was constructed. Metal roofs were used on vernacular agricultural buildings and farmhouses, but not on craftsman style bungalows. The metal roof has been on the Charles Miller house for two years.

In response to an inquiry by Vice-Chair Hartz, Ms. Abele explained HRER program funding is not available for individual residential properties; it is specifically targeted by City Council for residential historic districts. However there is another source of funding that is available from the Hotel Valley Ho's annual contributions to a new rehab fund, if the owner is willing to do a historically correct replacement of the roof.

In response to an inquiry by Chair Wimmer, Ms. Abele stated the specific action needed on this issue is to decide whether to schedule the initiation of an HP zoning case for the Charles Miller house for a future HPC agenda. In order for the homeowner to be eligible for funding, the home must first be placed on the local register.

Mr. Richard Funke, 4409 N. 66th Street, owner of the Charles Miller house, stated that he had supplied copies of two bids for approximately \$12,000, to replace the metal roof with a wood roof. He indicated that his research differed from the Historic Register Committee and noted that nearby buildings, which were built in the same time period as this home, have metal roofs, including an older home on 70th Street, south of Osborn. He installed the metal roof after he moved the house to its current location to prevent its demolition. He stated that he had no more funds and that if the Commission wanted the roof replaced, it would have to provide the monies. He would be willing to replace the metal roof with a wooden roof if funds were available.

Discussion ensued.

Commissioner Howard stated that the Historic Register Committee recommendation on the Charles Miller house should be put under continuance, pending resolution of the metal roof issue. Mr. Funke was in agreement.

Discussion ensued.

Vice-Chair Hartz stated this item would be kept as one of importance. Ms. Abele agreed and stated another report, taking this meeting's discussion into consideration, would be presented at the August meeting.

6. Committee Reports/Meetings Schedules/Discussion

- **Community Outreach Committee**

Vice-Chair Hartz stated he had been out of town for six weeks and no meetings occurred, but he was endeavoring to reach Committee members to put together a forum on the historic ranch style homes. He was hopeful this would occur before the next Commission meeting.

- **Historic Register Committee**

Commissioner Howard stated that at the Committee's last meeting, the Watch List was renamed the Awareness List, which they felt was more appropriate. She presented a matrix, which she described as a work in progress, a snapshot in time, and a report on the current status of historic properties in Scottsdale. Cathy Johnson, Committee member and former Commission member, took photographs in July of buildings on the Awareness List.

The Committee is scheduled to meet again on July 19, 2006.

Chair Wimmer requested that an electronic copy of the matrix be sent to Commission members.

- **Taliesin West Liaison**

No report.

7. HPO/Staff Report and Announcements

Ms. Abele stated she was continuing to work on the 5th Avenue presentation and it should be ready by the end of the summer.

Mr. Meserve informed the Commission that the Bureau of Reclamation (BOR) has done work along the old canals as well as the laterals and that a BOR representative met with staff and requested that two laterals in Scottsdale be considered for designation on the local register. Research will be done by Preservation staff and the BOR request will be a future agenda item.

8. Commissioner Comments and Announcements

Mr. Meserve announced that he, Commissioner Dallett, and Ian Johnson attended the statewide historic preservation conference, "Changing Places" in Glendale on June 15-17. He stated that it was a good annual conference overall, but attendance was down from last year.

9. Public Comments

No members of the public wished to address the Commission.

10. Future Meetings and Agenda Items

Commissioner Winslow opined that it would be a good exercise for the Commission to analyze the Hotel Valley Ho project to create consistent guidelines for Certificates of Appropriateness. Ms. Abele stated there were plans to address this before the end of the year and the process had already been started to use the Hotel Valley Ho project for a training session. She suggested that a Saturday morning workshop be conducted for this training.

In response to an inquiry by Commissioner Lockwood, Ms. Abele stated that meetings have started with the HOAs of the garden apartments around 2nd Street, consistent with the direction from the Commission to staff to proceed with these meetings, and procedures are being developed for designation.

Chair Wimmer reminded the members to keep staff up to date on their availability/non-availability.

11. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 6:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
AV-Tronics, Inc.